

Michael M. Hull, Andrew Elby





Surprise! Sophisticated view of calculations

[When asked to evaluate the plug and chug solution] Right away you can put out an answer, and it's easier for it to really click I think: "No matter what numbers you put in, the difference becomes 2". Between people who understand, this way of thinking is easier to transfer to the other person. If it's a kid who doesn't know physics, he would absolutely not understand this - zero percent. But if it is between people who know physics, both would understand it 100%. With my answer, even a kid would understand it 50-60%.

Tadao sees the advantage of the more calculation-based solution for faciliting communication with experts about the problem's conceptual conclusion, but thinks his more conceptual solution is better for communicating this with novices.

References

*A. Elby, R. E. Scherr, T. L. McCaskey, R. Hodges, E. F. Redish, D. M. Hammer, and T. Bing, Open Source Tutorials in Physics Sense-making: Suite I (2007). ** H. Uematsu, Physics Education in University 17, 129-132 (2011). (Details of the implementation of Open Source Tutorials at Tokyo Gakugei University, written in Japanese)

"Plug and Chug Solution"

(Written by interviewer) $v = v_a + a f$ $()_{N=1+10\times5}$ 50 = 52

21

Conclusion

Students besides Tadao integrated calculations with conceptual reasoning



So, once, just solve the problem. But it's not "get out that answer, write it and be done." Rather, look to see if it's different than what you were thinking initially and if so, think why - that will make it easier to understand.

Miu

First, to some degree you have an image, and, and then you write [the equation and substitutions]. But, if you just substitute... "since there is this equation, substitute and go, the answer comes out, the difference comes out, so, wow, it's two meters/second faster" ... it is not very good

Surprisingly, Japanese students who took a conceptual physics class developed a more sophisticated epistemology towards mathematics in the context of physics.

How this happened remains an open question that would be interesting to pursue

This work is supported in part by NSF grants EEC-0835880 and REC 04-40113